

APPROVED MINUTES OF THE STATE OF IDAHO PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS  
COMMISSION MEETING OF MARCH 31 – APRIL 1, 2016

**ATTENDANCE**

Members present at March 31 committee meetings: Allred, Chipman, Hedeem, Henry, Johnson, Koehler, McKinney, Meyer, Nuckols, Roark, Saffle, Sulfridge, Van Mullem, Zeydel. SDE staff present: Colón, Haas, Lackey, Markland, Schwab. Absent: Enger, Mikolajczyk, Nelson, Welton. Guests: Marcia Beckman, Brian Church, Alison Henken, Christina Linder, Karen Seay.

Members present at the April 1 general meeting: Allred, Hedeem, Henry, Johnson, Koehler, McKinney, Meyer, Nuckols, Roark, Saffle, Sulfridge, Van Mullem, Zeydel. SDE staff present: Colón, Haas, Lackey, Markland, Schwab. Absent: Chipman, Enger, Milokajczyk, Nelson, Welton. Guests: Brian Church, Terry Gilbert, Alison Henken.

Lisa Colón announced that Commission staff member Christie Miranda has resigned and relocated to another state.

**AGENDA REVIEW/REVISIONS/APPROVAL**

**M/S (Hedeem/McKinney): To approve the March 31 – April 1, 2016, Commission meeting agenda as printed.** Motion carried unanimously.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**M/S (McKinney/Roark): To approve the January 7-8, 2016, Commission meeting minutes as printed.** Motion carried unanimously.

**EVERY STUDENT SUCCEEDS ACT (ESSA) – CERTIFICATION**

Karen Seay, Director of Federal Programs in the Department of Education, reported to Commission members on the transition from the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) Act of 2001 to the new Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) of 2015. Under NCLB, Title I-A was tasked with ensuring that all teachers in core academic subjects were highly qualified; Title II-A funds were used in meeting that requirement. These federal highly qualified requirements were in addition to state certification requirements. Now, under the new ESSA, the highly qualified requirement is removed effective July 1, 2016. All states will move to one system that meets applicable state certification and licensure requirements, including requirements for alternative certification routes. Idaho will continue to support the hiring of teachers who demonstrate content mastery. During the 2016-2017 school year, the State Department of Education will review its current certification requirements. In moving to one system, changes may be made to ensure that all teachers demonstrate content mastery in their assignments, but the Department of

Education will keep districts updated in this area. During this same 2016-2017 school year, all states must continue to comply with the special education certification requirements of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA) of the past. Under that act, special education teachers must 1) have obtained full certification as a special education teacher (including certification obtained through certification alternative routes) or passed the state's special education teacher licensing examination and hold a license to teach in the state as a special education teacher; 2) not have had special education certification or licensure requirements waived on an emergency, temporary, or provisional basis; and 3) hold at least a bachelor's degree.

## **STATE BOARD REPORT**

Alison Henken, K-12 Accountability and Projects Program Manager in the State Board office, reported on the following board items:

1. The State Board has received feedback recently from the U.S. Department of Education on the need to review Idaho's standards for administrators and possibly adjust where those standards are on the schedule for updating, as there have been a number of changes nationally in recommendations for administrator standards.
2. In July of 2015, statute became effective requiring 3 credits of teacher evaluation professional development credit for all school administrators. The higher education institutions are working on developing that coursework. The State Board is willing to develop rule related to the requirement and is requesting stakeholder feedback to further clarify the requirement language. Lisa Colón added that the Department of Education, in support of the requirement and with Title II-A dollars, is providing many face-to-face training opportunities for which college credit will be available. Some of those training opportunities will fulfill the administrator renewal requirement, and those credits can be applied to the requirement. All details can be found on the training tab at: <http://www.sde.idaho.gov/federal-programs/teacher/>.
3. Last year there was language put into statute that centered on college and career advising, but there was no funding attached to the statute. This year \$5 million was put into the public school budget for college and career advising. The money is not intended to be used to pay for an existing counselor already on staff; it is intended to expand a school's offering of college and career advising, and those who are going to be providing the advising must be able to demonstrate that they have been trained to do so. Models identified to support the implementation of college and career advising include near-peer/college student mentors; student ambassadors; virtual coaching; collaborative programs; transition coordinators; high school advisors; and school counselors, teachers, or paraprofessionals.

## **ESTABLISHING CRITERIA FOR LOW-PERFORMING PREPARATION PROGRAMS**

Alison Henken reported that, as a requirement under Title II, the U.S. Department of Education has requested that Idaho, among other states, take action to establish criteria for low-performing or at-risk for low-performing Idaho educator preparation programs (both traditional and alternate route). As a part of that effort, this issue was discussed in both the Idaho Coalition for Educator Preparation (ICEP), which is formerly the Institutions of Higher Education (IHE) Coalition, and in the Idaho Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (IACTE). Both groups recommend that for the current reporting year (2014-2015), when there are not yet any federal regulations requiring Idaho to do more, the use of Idaho's existing program review process is the most practical and the simplest. The focus would be the program level (the individual program within the higher education institution), not the unit level (the institution). In this manner, a program would be determined low-performing or at-risk for low-performing based on its level of program review status during 2014-2015 (and, if we are able to, during 2015-2016 as well) and as finalized by the State Board of Education. A "Conditionally Approved" university program for reasons other than a low number of completers or being a new program would be "At-Risk for Low-Performing" and a "Not Approved" program would be "Low-Performing."

**M/S (McKinney/Sulfridge): To accept and support the proposal presented by Alison Henken on behalf of ICEP concerning Low-Performing/At-Risk for Low-Performing educator preparation programs for Title II reporting and which will be forwarded for State Board of Education consideration.** Motion carried unanimously.

Alison emphasized that ICEP will continue to work on establishing criteria for low-performing preparation programs and related processes in order to be prepared for the long-overdue federal regulations for teacher preparation that Idaho, as well as all other states, will eventually be given and have to comply with. It is anticipated that those regulations will likely require the process to include outcomes of the teacher once the teacher is in the classroom, thus making it necessary for Idaho, in the near future, to transition to a more detailed system that includes those outcomes.

## **CONSIDERATION OF STIPULATIONS/FINAL ORDERS BY FULL COMMISSION**

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church, representing the Chief Certification Officer, presented *In re Connie Scovil*, Case #21410, to the Commission to decide whether to impose discipline on Ms. Scovil's certificate and, if so, what discipline to impose. Brian Church presented the Administrative Complaint and Default Order from Hearing Officer Gilmore, and argued that the grounds stated in the Administrative Complaint were deemed admitted under Idaho Code section 33-1209 because no hearing was requested within the time limit.

**M/S (McKinney/Sulfridge): To enter a Final Order in Case #21410 revoking Ms. Scovil's certificate, based upon the allegations stated in the Administrative Complaint.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Chipman, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church, representing the Chief Certification Officer, presented *In re Jay M. Ostler*, Case #21416, to the Commission to decide whether to impose discipline on Mr. Ostler's certificates and, if so, what discipline to impose. Brian Church presented the Administrative Complaint and Default Order from Hearing Officer Gilmore, and argued that the grounds stated in the Administrative Complaint were deemed admitted under Idaho Code section 33-1209 because no hearing was requested within the time limit.

**M/S (Zeydel/McKinney): To enter a Final Order in Case #21416 placing conditions on Mr. Ostler's certificates (ethics course, yearly background check for first two years, adherence to district drug policy, and random drug testing for two years), based upon the allegations stated in the Administrative Complaint.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Chipman, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the previously considered Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was previously rejected by the Commission. A Consent Order, however, was mistakenly signed and sent, purporting to adopt the Stipulation as a Final Order of the Commission. The Stipulation was re-presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (Sulfridge/Hedeen): To ratify and approve the previously considered Stipulation as written and ratify the previously entered Consent Order in Case #21327 regarding the certificate of Paul Orr.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Chipman, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, Roark, and Saffle were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the previously considered Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was previously rejected by the Commission. A Consent Order, however, was mistakenly signed and sent, purporting to adopt the Stipulation as a Final Order of the Commission. The Stipulation was re-presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (Sulfridge/Saffle): To ratify and approve the previously considered Stipulation as written and ratify the previously entered Consent Order in Case #21429 regarding the certificate of Johnna Martinez.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Chipman, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (McKinney/Sulfridge): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21521 regarding the certificate of Robert Alverson.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (Zeydel/McKinney): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21513 regarding the certificate of Miranda Bowen-Cofer.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and, having posed a question and requested discussion, voted as follows:

**M/S (Sulfridge/McKinney): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21542 regarding the certificate of Brent Bowman.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and, having posed a question and requested discussion, voted as follows:

**M/S (Zeydel/Sulfridge): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21533 regarding the certificate of Scott Bryant.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (McKinney/Zeydel): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21544 regarding the certificate of Bryan Chase.**

Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (Zeydel/McKinney): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21546 regarding the certificate of Meredith Dahlin.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and, having posed questions and requested discussion, voted as follows:

**M/S (Sulfridge/Zeydel): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21514 regarding the certificate of Pamela Houston-Powell.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and, having posed questions and requested discussion, voted as follows:

**M/S (McKinney/Sulfridge): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21430 regarding the certificate of Steve Kilgore.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (Zeydel/McKinney): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21551 regarding the certificate of Mindy Lincoln.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (Sulfridge/McKinney): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21520 regarding the certificate of Christy McNeal.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (McKinney/Zeydel): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21541 regarding the certificate of Jennifer Sandmeyer.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and, having posed a question and requested discussion, voted as follows:

**M/S (McKinney/Sulfridge): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21508 regarding the certificate of Craig Swart.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (Zeydel/Sulfridge): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21532 regarding the certificate of Patricia Valenzuela.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and, having posed questions and requested discussion, voted as follows:

**M/S (Sulfridge/Zeydel): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21529 regarding the certificate of Debra White.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and, having posed questions and requested discussion, voted as follows:

**M/S (Zeydel/McKinney): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21527 regarding the certificate of Rose Ann Abrahamson.** Motion carried. Commission members Allred, Henry, Koehler, Meyer, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church reviewed for the Commission the instances of misconduct, the statutes and principles in the *Code of Ethics for Idaho Professional Educators* that were violated, and the conditions of discipline imposed in the Stipulation and Consent Order for William McCarrell, Jr., Case #21010. The Commission had previously entered a Consent Order for this individual in 2011, agreeing to a Stipulation. Brian then presented to the Commission a recently-received Motion to Modify Stipulation and Consent Order from the attorney for William McCarrell, Jr. Brian first asked the Commission if they would accept the documentation recently submitted by William McCarrell, Jr. as items satisfying the discipline requirements for reinstatement; the Commission voted to **reject the submitted documentation**. Brian then asked for the Commission's decision on the Motion to Modify Stipulation and Consent Order; the Commission voted to **deny the motion** and take no further action on the motion.

Lisa Colón reported on an email/question received from Amy White, a local attorney representing a law firm that provides legal counsel to several school districts throughout Idaho. Amy White's question related to DonorsChoose.org, the website of a nonprofit organization that allows individuals to donate directly to public school classroom projects, and the organization then funds the projects requested by teachers. DonorsChoose considers the item purchased through a DonorsChoose award the personal property of the teacher. Questions/concern raised about such funding and the items received, however, include whose property is the item received; can the educator take the item with him when changing schools or districts; how are the possible tax consequences decided for the teacher who claims the item is now his personal property; would the Commission expect such a situation to be reported as a Code of Ethics violation; does the



Code of Ethics need to be revised to be more current, etc. It was decided that this issue will be discussed further in the Executive Committee, and a recommendation will be brought forth to the full Commission in June.

## **ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT**

Commission administrator Lisa Colón (unless indicated otherwise) reported on the following.

1. The Standards Committee will be reviewing what ICEP is proposing in the way of standards for clinical practice (student teaching) and will then provide feedback on that effort.
2. The regional career fairs (where hiring school districts will be able to have access to graduating educator preparation program candidates) are scheduled as follows: Nampa – April 5; Twin Falls – April 21; Coeur d’Alene – May 11; Moscow – May 12. Currently there are 11 out of 15 school districts participating in the Nampa career fair. The higher education institutions are recommending that their candidates attend all of the career fairs.
3. Last year’s proposed rule changes from the Standards Committee were all approved by the 2016 legislature.
4. The report from the September 19-22 Idaho State University program review will be considered by the Standards Committee at this March meeting. The Boise State University program review was just completed on March 5-8.
5. The Mathematics, Science, Elementary Education, Pre-Service Technology, and Visual/Performing Arts standards reviews have now all been completed.
6. Lisa and Cina Lackey attended the National Association of State Directors of Teacher Education and Certification (NASDTEC) Winter Symposium in February, and Cina participated in the National Association for Alternative Certification (NAAC) Conference in March.
7. Upcoming staff travel includes the following: Region 3 Career Fair (April 5) – Lisa; Idaho Prevention and Support Conference (April 12-15) – Cina, Annette Schwab, Shannon Haas; Region 4 Career Fair (April 21) – Lisa; Idaho Falls Ethics Hearing (April 28-29) – Annette, Shannon, Lisa, and Brian Church; Educational Testing Service (ETS) Site Visit (May 3-6) – Lisa and Cina; Regions 1 and 2 Career Fairs (May 11-12) – Lisa; Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP) Clinic (May 18-20) – Lisa and Annette; NASDTEC Annual Meeting (June 4-7) – Lisa and Cina; Council of Chief State School Officers (CCSSO) – National and State Collaboration for Educator Excellence (NSCEE) Annual Summit (June 8-10) – Lisa and Cina.

## **AUTHORIZATIONS COMMITTEE**

Chair Elisa Saffle reported that during their March 31 meeting, the Authorizations Committee recommended that the Commission approve the following new Teacher to New Certificate/Endorsement requests (for the 2015-2016 school year):

BEASLEY, Susan, Horseshoe Bend #73, Economics 6/12  
BLACKER, Kristi, Middleton #134, Generalist K/12  
BOHRER, Jennifer, Taylor's Crossing Charter School #461, American Government/Political Science 6/12  
COLOMBINI, Kimberly, West Bonner County #83, Chemistry 6/12  
DABELL, Trent, Jefferson County Joint #251, School Principal Pre-K/12  
DINNING, Kevin, West Bonner County #83, School Principal Pre-K/12  
FOSTER, Jennifer, West Ada #2, Natural Science 6/12  
HOWARD, David, Kellogg Joint #391, Spanish 6/12  
KEEFER, Kayleen, Idaho STEM Academy #485, Health 6/12  
McCAFFERY, Catherine, Caldwell #132, Birth/Grade 3  
RAINO, Jenna, Garden Valley #71, Chemistry 6/12  
TANKERSLY, Wesley, Marsing Joint #363, Health K/12

Chair Elisa Saffle reported that during their March 31 meeting, the Authorizations Committee recommended that the Commission approve the following new Teacher to New Certificate/Endorsement requests (for the 2016-2017 school year):

FULGENZI, Eric, Forrest M. Bird Charter School #487, Spanish 6/12

During their March 31 meeting, the Authorizations Committee recommended that the Commission approve the following renewal Teacher to New Certificate/Endorsement requests (for the 2015-2016 school year):

BRADLEY, Charlene, West Ada #2, Generalist K/12 (4)  
DUBOSE, Jason, Caldwell #132, Generalist K/12 (2)  
LINDQUIST, Derek, Melba Joint #136, English as a New Language K/12 (2)  
LITTLE, Tim, Marsing Joint #363, School Principal Pre-K/12 (3)  
SWIFT, Caroline, Whitepine Joint #288, Business Technology Education 6/12 (2)

During their March 31 meeting, the Authorizations Committee recommended that the Commission approve 27 Alternative Authorization - Content Specialist Endorsement requests (for the 2015-2016 school year).

During their March 31 meeting, the Authorizations Committee recommended that the Commission deny 1 Alternative Authorization – Content Specialist Endorsement request (for the 2015-2016 school year).

Lisa Colón noted that the one-year State Board of Education Emergency Provisional Certificate is now available. Information on that certificate can be found within the

application packet on the following website: <http://www.sde.idaho.gov/cert-psc/cert/alt-auth.html>.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Authorizations Committee.** Motion carried unanimously.

### **PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE**

In Chair Ginny Welton's absence, committee member Elisa Saffle reported that the committee invited Rick Kennedy, Instructional Technology Coordinator in the Department of Education, to discuss the Educational Resource Library (ERL or "earl") on the Department of Education website and how it may be used to support professional development relating to the Code of Ethics. The Code of Ethics/Professional Standards Commission will be a link on ERL. Through this link educators applying for, reinstating, or revising their certification will be able to access several different types of typical ethics cases that are being developed and learn about the scenario in each case, why it was a violation, and why it was in opposition to a specific principle in the Code of Ethics.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Professional Development Committee.** Motion carried unanimously.

### **BUDGET SUBCOMMITTEE**

In Chair Laural Nelson's absence, committee member Mikki Nuckols reported that for the month of December, revenue was \$15,660; expenditures were \$52,616, with expenditures exceeding revenue by \$36,956. In addition to routine operational costs, there were the following expenses: \$400 – Commission meetings and Commission member bags; \$2,300 – contracted investigator services; \$4,000 – standards reviews for Math and all of the Science areas; \$700 – Cina's attendance at the NASDTEC Winter Symposium. It should be noted that there were three pay periods in December.

For the month of January, revenue was \$30,790; expenditures were \$44,877, with expenditures exceeding revenue by \$14,087. Expenses not part of routine operational costs during the month included the following: \$6,600 – January Commission meeting; \$5,000 – standards reviews for all of the Science areas and Elementary Education; \$750 – Cina's attendance at the NAAC Conference; \$2,500 – remainder of cost for ISU program review.

For February, revenue was \$37,195; expenditures were \$42,415, with expenditures exceeding revenue by \$5,220. Expenses not part of routine operational costs during the month included the following: \$250 – remainder of cost for January Commission meeting; \$4,500 – standards reviews for all of Science areas, Elementary Education, and Pre-Service Technology; \$150 – supplies for upcoming standards reviews; \$1,000 – Cina's attendance at the NAAC Conference and Lisa and Cina's attendance at a CCSSO meeting. The accounting reports for all three months were reconciled and balanced.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Budget Subcommittee.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **STANDARDS COMMITTEE**

Chair Heather Van Mullem reported on the following committee discussion items (unless indicated otherwise):

1. Committee members have decided to postpone their work on the Standards Committee working plan and the Commission Procedures Manual until next year.
2. The State Board's Idaho Indian Education Committee visited the meeting and shared their recommendations for consideration regarding closing the academic gaps in the education of American Indian students in Idaho. These recommendations will be brought to the Core Standards Review scheduled for November of 2016. The Indian Education Summit will be held June 13 and 14 in Boise. The theme of the summit is Culturally Responsive Teaching: Practice and Purpose.
3. The Idaho Higher Education Literacy Partnership (IHELP) group visited the meeting and shared the updates on their work since the January Commission meeting. Their next task is to create competencies under the four Literacy Standards for Educator Preparation that they will be proposing to the Idaho Literacy Committee.
4. Brigham Young University – Idaho has proposed a new program for certification – Special Education – K/12 Generalist Teacher.

**The Commission PASSED the Standards Committee's recommendation to conditionally approve the Brigham Young University – Idaho/Special Education – K/12 Generalist Teacher new program proposal.** Motion carried unanimously.

5. The committee discussed the state team report from the Idaho State University program approval onsite visit and reviewed the institution's revisions for three of its programs.

**After consideration of Idaho State University's planned revisions for its English as a New Language, Economics, and English Language Arts programs, the Commission PASSED the Standards Committee's recommendation to approve the Idaho State University state team report as written with a change in status from Not Approved to Conditionally Approved for the following programs:**

- **English as a New Language**
- **Economics**
- **English Language Arts**

Motion carried unanimously.

6. ICEP has been tasked with developing proposed Clinical Supervision Standards for consideration as requirements for institutional recommendations and had requested that the Standards Committee provide feedback on the standards. The committee reviewed the standards and supports the draft of the Clinical Supervision Standards as written.
7. After considerable revision effort, the Program Review Manual has now been completed. It covers the full unit review, state-specific requirements, and focused visits.

**The Commission PASSED the Standards Committee’s recommendation to approve the Program Review Manual for use, with minor technical changes as necessary by staff, for implementation during 2016-2017.** Motion carried unanimously.

8. The committee discussed program approval reviews that will be conducted through the national accrediting body of the Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP) and state program review expenses. CAEP has agreed to provide training to program approval team individuals selected by the State Department of Education to review the educator preparation programs of institutions that do not participate in CAEP. Each of those institutions will cover the cost of the CAEP portion of their program review.

**The Commission PASSED the Standards Committee’s recommendation to encourage the training of Department of Education program approval state team members by CAEP.** Motion carried unanimously.

9. The committee considered the recommendations from the content area experts who reviewed/revised standards in the following areas during the 2015-2016 academic year: mathematics; science; elementary education; pre-service technology; and visual/performing arts.

**The Commission PASSED the Standards Committee’s recommendation to approve the Mathematics Standards and Mathematics Endorsement as written.** Motion carried unanimously.

Lisa Colón noted that anyone who has a Basic Mathematics Endorsement will now be able to teach geometry.

**The Commission PASSED the Standards Committee’s recommendation to approve the Biology, Chemistry, Earth/Space Science, Natural Science, Physical Science, and Physics Standards as written and to approve the Biology, Chemistry, Earth/Space Science, Natural Science, Physical Science, and Physics Endorsements with the change to remove capitalization in text when referring to content, not a specific course name.** Motion carried unanimously.

**The Commission PASSED the Standards Committee’s recommendation to approve the Elementary Education Standards with the removal of outside grade range language, as State Board staff, in collaboration with stakeholders, is working on a solution to address teaching outside the grade range area; the Commission PASSED the Standards Committee’s recommendation to approve the Elementary Education Endorsement as written.** Motion carried unanimously.

Lisa Colón added that the Elementary Education content area experts 1) recommended adding the All Subjects K-8 Endorsement into rule and 2) were very specific and deliberate with their content area language so that it encompassed all content areas, including the arts, the STEM disciplines, language arts, social studies, science, health education, physical education, mathematics, and math practices, and would ensure that institutions are preparing candidates who are up to Idaho standards in all subject areas.

**The Commission PASSED the Standards Committee’s recommendation to approve the Pre-Service Technology Standards as written.** Motion carried unanimously.

**The Commission PASSED the Standards Committee’s recommendation to approve the Visual/Performing Arts Standards and the Visual/Performing Arts Endorsement as written.** Motion carried unanimously.

Heather Van Mullem added that the Visual/Performing Arts Standards and Endorsement Review Team recommended that the Department of Education convene a group of content area experts in Dance to consider a Dance Endorsement. The Standards Committee recommends that the Department of Education follow through on convening that group of content experts.

Lisa Colón added that Drama will now be known as Theatre Arts.

10. In the area of completed 2015-2016 teacher preparation program reviews, that of Idaho State University was conducted September 19-22, 2015, and that of Boise State University was conducted March 5-8, 2016.

Standards Committee member Dana Johnson thanked Lisa Colón for her continuing work at developing a matrix of approved higher education programs across Idaho. This valuable resource will be available in the near future for reference by high schools for college and career readiness and also by higher education institutions.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Standards Committee.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Chair Esther Henry reported that the Executive Committee met with Deputy Attorney General Brian Church, Shannon Haas, and Annette Schwab to discuss ethics case information.

The committee discussed the Code of Ethics principle regarding the \$50 monetary gift limitation for educators (see page 8, CONSIDERATION OF STIPULATIONS/FINAL ORDERS BY FULL COMMISSION, last paragraph). Committee members felt that any equipment donations, etc. should be assigned to a particular school or district rather than an individual teacher. Brian Church will draft language to that effect for consideration at the June meeting.

**M/S (Chipman/Allred): To move the Executive Committee into Executive Session, which was entered for the Executive Committee to consider investigatory records exempt from disclosure under Chapter 1 of Title 74, Idaho Code.** Motion carried unanimously.

Brian reviewed the 14 cases needing Executive Committee decisions.

**M/S (Chipman/Koehler): To move the Executive Committee into Open Session, after entering Executive Session to consider investigatory records exempt from disclosure under Chapter 1 of Title 74, Idaho Code.** Motion carried unanimously.

Esther Henry reported that actions taken by the Executive Committee included: 4 no probable cause; 3 indefinite suspension with conditions; 5 letters of reprimand; 1 revocation; and 1 case was pulled by Brian Church.

There are 10 cases for the Executive Committee to review for further consideration. Of those, there are 6 in which the committee decided that there should be no change to the previous stipulation; 1 in which an additional requirement was added; 1 in which the date of completion was changed to reflect time served; 1 in which there was a voluntary surrender of certificate; and 1 in which a requirement was removed from the stipulation.

Additionally, there are 2 ethics hearings scheduled – one on April 8 in Boise and another on April 29 in the Idaho Falls area. There are 4 cases on hold; 1 case awaiting response from the respondent; 12 cases in which the administrative complaints have been filed; 15 cases needing Commission staff/deputy attorney general action; and 6 cases closed.

Lisa Colón updated Commission members on the full-Commission motion made at the October 8-9, 2015, Commission meeting to post on the Commission website the names, case numbers, dates, and final orders in public record Commission ethics cases. Those ethics cases of the past five years will be made available on the website under the Code of Ethics as of April 15, 2016.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Executive Committee.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **LEADERSHIP TEAM**

Chair Esther Henry reported that the Leadership Team met by teleconference on March 16. At that time, Lisa Colón gave the team a brief summary of her administrative report for the upcoming March Commission meeting. The team reviewed the March full Commission meeting agenda and added the ESSA presentation; they also reviewed the budget. Possible issues with ABCTE were discussed briefly. The next Leadership Team teleconference will be held on June 8.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Leadership Team.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

### **Setting of Commission 2016-2017 Meeting Dates**

The Commission discussed the scheduling of their meeting dates for 2016-2017.

**M/S (McKinney/Saffle): To accept the following Commission meeting dates for 2016-2017: September 22-23; November 3-4; January 19-20; March 30-31; and June 8-9.**

### **Hotel Preference for Out-of-Area Members for 2016-2017**

Out-of-area Commission members decided to stay at the downtown Hampton Inn during the 2016-2017 year.

## **COMMUNICATION PLAN**

Heather Van Mullem reported that items of interest in these meeting minutes for member communication to constituencies include the following:

- **HQT Requirement to End July 1.** Under the new Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) of 2015, the U.S. Department of Education has announced that the HQT requirement will be removed July 1 (see page 1, EVERY STUDENT SUCCEEDS ACT [ESSA] – CERTIFICATION).
- **Idaho Establishing Criteria for Low-Performing Teacher Preparation Programs.** Current program reporting process to be used for current reporting year; status to be reported at program, not unit, level based on program review status as follows: Approved – appropriately performing, Conditionally Approved – at-risk for low performing, Not Approved – low performing (see page 2, ESTABLISHING CRITERIA FOR LOW PERFORMING PREPARATION PROGRAMS).
- **Authorizations Update.** Teacher-to-New Certificates/Endorsements – 18 requests approved; Content Specialist – 27 requests approved, 1 request denied (see page 9, AUTHORIZATIONS COMMITTEE).



- **Department of Education Website Update.** Five years of final orders in ethics cases to be posted on website on April 15 (see page 14, EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, last paragraph).
- **Spring 2016 Career Fair Dates.** Regional career fairs have been and continue to be held around the state (see page 9, ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT, item 2).
- **2015-2016 Completed Teacher Preparation Program Reviews.** Reviews conducted at ISU and BSU (see page 11, STANDARDS COMMITTEE, item 10).
- **2015-2016 Completed Standards Reviews.** Reviews completed in mathematics, science, elementary education, pre-service technology, and visual/performing arts areas (see page 11, STANDARDS COMMITTEE, item 9).
- **2016-2017 Commission Meeting Dates.** Meetings set for September 22-23, November 3-4, January 19-20, March 30-31, and June 8-9 (see page 16, NEW BUSINESS – Setting of Commission 2016-2017 Meeting Dates).

## ADJOURNMENT

**M/S (Sulfridge/McKinney): To adjourn the meeting.** Motion carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 11:45 a.m.

---

Mary Jane Markland, Secretary  
Professional Standards Commission

---

Lisa Colón, Administrator  
Professional Standards Commission