



**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE IDAHO PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS COMMISSION (PSC)
THURSDAY, APRIL 13, 2023**

Commission Chair Marianne Sletteland called the meeting to order at 9:11 a.m.

Commission Members Present: Stephanie Brodwater, Tate Castleton, Kristi Enger, Angela Gillman, Lance Harrison, Katie Horner, Ramona Lee, Amy McBride, Jamee Nixon, Karen Pyron, Melissa Rose, Lori Sanchez, Marianne Sletteland, Emma Wood

Commission Members Absent: Vanessa Anthony-Stevens, Ryan Cantrell, Stacey Jensen

1. Agenda Review/Approval

M/S (Lee/Harming)

I move to approve the April 13-14, 2023, agenda as written.

Voice Vote. **Motion Carries**

2. February 2, 2023, Minutes Review/Revision/Approval

M/S (Pyron/Harming)

I move to approve the minutes from the February 2, 2023, meeting of the Professional Standards Commission as written.

Voice Vote. **Motion Carries**

3. Consideration of Final Orders/Stipulation Adoptions

Deputy Attorney General Jim Rice presented the following cases to the Commission for consideration:

Case # 22244 M/S (Harming/Wood)

In case number 22244, concerning the certificate of Stacy Hutchinson, I move that the Professional Standards Commission accept the proposed stipulation as written and enter the accompanying consent order, which will be effective once signed.

Karen Pyron asked DAG Rice if use of the term 'district' rather than 'charter' in the stipulation document is problematic. Rice responded that it is not; the term 'local education agency may also be used.'

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell – absent, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harming - recuse, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - absent, Lee - recuse, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - yes, Sletteland - yes, Wood - yes. **Motion Carries.**

Case # 22242 M/S (Enger/Wood)

In case number 22242, concerning the certificate of Khristopher Kohlmeier, I move that the Professional Standards Commission accept the proposed stipulation as written and enter the accompanying consent order, which will be effective once signed.

Karen Pyron asked to explain the difference between 'indefinitely suspend' and 'revoke.' DAG Rice explained that in the case of an indefinite suspension, the defendant can reapply if conditions are met. The Executive Committee could recommend to full Commission if they determined that the evidence was sufficient. Pyron asked whether the defendant's employing district has any responsibility. DAG Rice responded that the defendant resigned upon complaint.

Cina Lackey asked how the defendant meets the condition; is the condition met if the defendant states that he will not repeat his behavior? DAG Rice responded that the defendant is required to provide evidence to the satisfaction of the Executive Committee; a statement from the defendant is not sufficient in itself. Lance Harrison added that the defendant could show evidence of coursework, letter from a counselor or psychologist. Annette Schwab added that the Executive Committee has full information about the case and will need to take all case details into account.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell – absent, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harming - recuse, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - absent, Lee - recuse, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - yes, Sletteland - yes, Wood - yes. **Motion Carries.**

Case # 22239 M/S (Harming/Brodwater)

In case number 22239, concerning the certificate of Angela Meadows, I move that the Professional Standards Commission accept the proposed stipulation as written and enter the accompanying consent order, which will be effective once signed.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell – absent, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harming - recuse, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - absent, Lee - recuse, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - yes, Sletteland - yes, Wood - yes. **Motion Carries.**

Case # 22243 M/S (Brodwater/Harming)

In case number 22243, concerning the certificate of Kyah Piva, I move that the Professional Standards Commission accept the proposed stipulation as written and enter the accompanying consent order, which will be effective once signed.

Karen Pyron asked whether the defendant can receive a different sort of certificate to teach. DAG Rice responded that the defendant cannot.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell – absent, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harming - recuse, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - absent, Lee - recuse, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - yes, Sletteland - yes, Wood - yes. **Motion Carries.**

Case # 22234 M/S (Enger/Harming)

In case number 22234, concerning the certificate of John Cook, I move that the Professional Standards Commission enter a final order that is effective when signed, incorporating as findings of fact the allegations in the administrative complaint, adopting any counts alleged by the Chief Certification Officer as conclusions of law, and imposing the discipline requested by the Chief Certification Officer in the Request for Relief in the Administrative Complaint.

Stephanie Brodwater asked for the difference between revocation and permanent revocation. DAG Rice responded that permanent revocation applies to specific felonies.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell – absent, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harming - recuse, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - absent, Lee - recuse, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - yes, Sletteland - yes, Wood - yes. **Motion Carries.**

Case # 22236 M/S (Pyron/Brodwater)

In case number 22236, concerning the certificate of Dustin Kisner, I move that the Professional Standards Commission enter a final order that is effective when signed, incorporating as findings of fact the allegations in the administrative complaint, adopting any counts alleged by the Chief Certification Officer as conclusions of law, and imposing permanent revocation of Mr. Kisner’s certificate under Idaho Code §33-1208(2).

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell – absent, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harming - recuse, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - absent, Lee - recuse, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - yes, Sletteland - yes, Wood - yes. **Motion Carries.**

Case # 22217 M/S (Brodwater/Harming)

In case number 22217, concerning the certificate of Robert Schmidt, I move that the Professional Standards Commission enter a final order that is effective when signed, incorporating as findings of fact the allegations in the administrative complaint, adopting any counts alleged by the Chief Certification Officer as conclusions of law, and imposing the discipline requested by the Chief Certification Officer in the Request for Relief in the Administrative Complaint.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell – absent, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harming - recuse, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - absent, Lee - recuse, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - yes, Sletteland - yes, Wood - yes. **Motion Carries.**

4. 23-24 Meeting Dates – Action Item

M/S (Harming/Horner)

I move to approve the following dates for Professional Standards Commission meetings: September 21-22, 2023; December 7-8, 2023 (virtual); February 8-9, 2024 (virtual); April 4-5, 2024; and June 20-21, 2024.

Voice Vote. **Motion Carries**

5. 23-24 Chair/Vice Chair Nomination Process for June Meeting

Commission Chair Marianne Sletteland announced that during the June meeting of the PSC, elections will occur for Chair and Vice Chair positions for the 2023-2024 school year. Any member can be nominated. Sletteland encouraged interested members to talk with their colleagues so that everyone knows who’s interested in serving. Nominations will be sought on Thursday, June 15, and election by ballot will be held on Friday, June 16.

6. Committee Work Upon Adjournment of Full Commission

Commission Chair Marianne Sletteland adjourned the full Commission meeting at 10:45 a.m.

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE IDAHO PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS COMMISSION (PSC)
FRIDAY, APRIL 14, 2023**

Commission Chair Marianne Sletteland called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

Commission Members Present: Stephanie Brodwater, Kristi Enger, Angela Gillman, Lance Harrison, Katie Horner, Ramona Lee, Amy McBride, Jamee Nixon, Karen Pyron, MeLissa Rose, Lori Sanchez, Marianne Sletteland, Emma Wood

Commission Members Absent: Vanessa Anthony-Stevens, Ryan Cantrell, Stacey Jensen

1. Consideration of Final Orders/Stipulation Adoptions, continued
No items were presented
2. Administrative Report (APPENDIX A)
Cina Lackey, PSC Administrator, provided an Administrative report.

Superintendent Critchfield stopped by to meet and speak with the Commission.

The superintendent has been attending legislative roadshow meetings in south Idaho this week, with three more to come next week in north Idaho. Knowing the importance of well-trained teachers to Idaho's students, she has been having conversations with Idaho's colleges of education and learning about their programs of preparation. The Superintendent has learned through her experiences that all elementary teachers need to be reading teachers who are founded in the science of reading. Teacher candidates need more practical experience in the classroom before they student teach. Idaho State University and Northwest Nazarene University are doing some great things to increase teacher candidate experiences. Teacher preparation programs need to develop classroom management capacity and parent communication capacity in new educators. Many new teachers don't feel they're equipped with the classroom management techniques required for the modern classroom. Many teacher education students feel least prepared to develop engaging and meaningful communication with parents. The Professional Standards Commission feels like the right group to ask to help recommend some of these practices for use by Idaho's colleges of education.

Karen Pyron asked Superintendent Critchfield about changes to mastery. Superintendent Critchfield responded that she recommended the movement of \$1.2 million from mastery-based education to dyslexia. The money was not available to implement new mastery programs or sustain an existing mastery program; \$8,000 of that money was available to a district only to notify parents that a school was moving to a mastery model. This seemed like an ineffective use of the money. The money was moved to address an immediate need for dyslexia professional development. The superintendent emphasized that moving to mastery is an important decision. The superintendent's experience has been that the districts who took the time to carefully consider the process and plan the details of mastery implementation had positioned themselves to be more successful. Those districts who did not take the time for careful consideration and planning did not succeed and moved back to a more traditional classroom model.

Karen Pyron asked whether 6x6 Training would continue; it was intended to be ongoing professional development for K-12 mastery teachers. Greg Wilson, Chief of Staff for the State Department of Education, responded that he will chat with the Deputy Superintendent and the Curriculum director and get back to Pyron about the 6x6 training.

Lori Sanchez mentioned she's interested in learning more about the teacher apprenticeship program. The Superintendent responded that she hopes for a successful first go at the program this year, to take it back to the legislature.

3. Legislative Report

Greg Wilson, Chief of Staff for the State Department of Education, and Julie Oberle, Public School Finance, provided presentations (located at <https://www.sde.idaho.gov/events/leg-roadshow/>) summarizing policy and budgetary results of the 2023 Legislative Session.

4. Committee Reports

a. Operations Committee Report (APPENDIX B)

Marianne Sletteland presented the Operations Committee Report. Angela Gillman asked if the PSC would be within budget right now if each meeting was held in person. Helen Henderson responded that would probably be the case; however, there are additional expenditures that were not budgeted for this year, including PC upgrades and covering substitute reimbursement for classroom teachers at every meeting.

b. Executive Committee Report (APPENDIX C)

Chanel Harming Provided the Executive Committee Report.

c. Joint Committee Report (APPENDIX D)

Karen Pyron and Kristi Enger presented the Joint Standards and Recruitment, Retention, and Authorizations Committee Report.

5. Member Reports

Chanel Harming provided a report from the Indian Education Committee. Registration is open for the Indian Education Summit, occurring June 12-13 at Lewis-Clark State College. Registration is also open for the first Hispanic/American Indian Healthcare Conference, occurring June 7-8 at College of Southern Idaho. Two new at-large members of the Idaho Indian Education Committee await confirmation by the Idaho State Board of Education. The State Department of Education's Office of Indian Education is working to assist tribal education agencies to develop accurate and authentic resources to support K-12 curricula and teacher preparation standards. Contact Johanna Jones for more information at 208-332-6968.

Ramona Lee reported on behalf of the Idaho Association of Special Education Administrators. An increased number of students requiring special education services is increasing the need for special education teachers. The need is especially large at the pre-K level, and administrators are seeking qualified candidates.

Karen Pyron provided a report from the Idaho School Boards Association (ISBA). The ISBA Board meets next week; legislative work has been the focus so far this year. Bills that didn't pass this year may show back up next year. Dr. Phil Gore is ISBA's newest employee and will serve as ISBA's Chief Learning Officer.

Kristi Enger provided a report from the Division of Career Technical Education (CTE). Registration is open for the CTE Connect Conference: July 12-15 at North Idaho College, August 2-5 at College of Western Idaho, and September 20-23 at Idaho State University.

Angela Gillman provided a report on behalf of the Idaho Education Association (IEA). The 2023 IEA Lobby Day was held January 16 at the Idaho Legislature. The IEA performed extensive work against voucher bills. Delegate Assembly occurs next week; proposal of targeted new business items occurs at the Assembly. Summer Institute is scheduled to occur in Lewiston July 26-29.

6. Travel Reimbursement Reminder

Chair Marianne Sletteland reminded Commission members to use the updated Travel Reimbursement form located in the SFTP “Member References” folder for reimbursement of travel costs for this meeting. The updated form includes an increased mileage rate of 65.5 cents per mile.

7. Adjourn

M/S (Gillman/Wood)

Meeting adjourned at 11:11 a.m.



APPENDIX A

Administrative Report

700 W State Street, Boise; JRW West Conference Room

April 14, 2023

PSC updates

Professional Standards Commission

- Section 33-1252, Idaho Code, establishes the professional standards commission and the process for the State Board of Education to consider appointments to the Commission. This includes the appointment of 18 members, including a member of the staff of the Department of Education and also a member from the Division of Career Technical Education. There was a discussion about adding a 19th member to include a member of the Office of the State Board of Education. The legislation did not move forward.

Educator Preparation Program Reviews

- The Boise State University - April 9-11, 2023 review was conducted as a CAEP review only. BSU have been granted state approval based on the last state review.
- The State Board of Education is amending the Educator Preparation Provider review process and the schedule for state reviews has been put on hold until the process can be finalized.

Dyslexia Professional Development and Certificate Renewal

<https://www.sde.idaho.gov/academic/ela-literacy/dyslexia-information.html>

Educator Career Fairs

The SDE will not host the regional Career Fairs this year but will resume next year. The goal is to hold the Career Fairs in early March to better meet the needs of the Local Education Agencies (LEAs) around the state.



APPENDIX B

Operations Committee Meeting

Physical Location: 650 W State Street, Boise; Lewis and Clark Conference Room, Second Floor

April 13, 2023

Members present: Marianne Sletteland, Chanel Harming, Kristi Enger, Karen Pyron, Angela Gillman

Members absent: none

Committee brought to order at 8:00 a.m.

1. Agenda and Minutes Review/Discussion – Information Item

Agenda Motion for Full PSC: I move to approve the April 13-14, 2023, agenda as written.

Minutes Motion for full PSC: I move to approve the minutes of the February 2, 2023, meeting of the Professional Standards Commission as written.

OR

I move to approve the minutes of the February 2, 2023, meeting of the Professional Standards Commission with the following amendments (list amendments).

2. FY23 Income and Expenditures Report – Information Item

Salary and benefits for FY23 were reported incorrectly; the allocation for salary/benefits is not \$456,000, it is \$506,100. Also, estimated Certification fees were increased to \$620,000 based on the last 5 years of reporting.

This is an information item. Salaries and benefits are not included in the spending authority through which PSC-related expenses are paid. Also, the certification fees 'budgeted' are an estimate of certification fees to be received in the upcoming fiscal year.

December 2022 (correction)

Revenue from certification fees: \$14,645

Expenditures, including salaries and benefits: \$37,652

Transactions balanced; expenditures exceeded revenue by \$23,007

January 2023

Revenue from certification fees: \$64,620

Expenditures, including salaries and benefits: \$42,680

Transactions balanced; revenue exceeded expenditures by \$21,940

February 2023

Revenue from certification fees: \$53,670

Expenditures, including salaries and benefits: \$39,621

Transactions balanced; revenue exceeded expenditures by \$14,049

March 2023

Revenue from certification fees: \$47,705

Expenditures, including salaries and benefits: \$58,269

Transactions balanced; expenditures exceeded revenue by \$10,564

As of April 1, 2023, 46% of PSC Spending Authority remains.

3. PSC Discussion

- PSC positions expiring 6/30/2023. Appointments/reappointments are scheduled to occur at the April 25-26, 2023, meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education:
 - School Superintendent
 - Classroom teacher
 - Special education administrator
 - Public teacher education



APPENDIX C

Executive Committee Meeting

650 W State Street, Boise; Lewis & Clark Conference Room, Second Floor

April 13, 2023

Members present: Chanel Harming, Lance Harrison, Katie Horner, Ramona Lee, Jamee Nixon, Melissa Rose

Members absent: Ryan Cantrell

Staff present: Annette Schwab and Jim Rice

M/S (RL/MR): Under Idaho Code 74-206 (1)(d), to move the Executive Committee into Executive Session to consider investigatory records exempt from disclosure under Chapter 1 of Title 74, Idaho Code. (11:15 AM) Harming – Yes, Harrison – Yes, Horner – Yes, Lee –Yes, Nixon – Yes, Rose – Yes, Cantrell – Absent

M/S (RL/JN): The Executive Committee of the Professional Standards Commission was called into Open Session, after entering Executive Session to consider investigatory records exempt from the disclosure under Chapter 1 of Title 74 Idaho Code. (1:46 PM) Harming – Yes, Harrison – Yes, Horner – Yes, Lee –Yes, Nixon – Yes, Rose – Yes, Cantrell – Absent

M/S (CH/RL): In case number 22235, I move that the Executive Committee not find probable cause. Motion carried by majority.

M/S (CH/JN): In case number 22237, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend permanent revocation. Motion carried by majority.

M/S (CH/MR): In case number 22240, I move that the Executive Committee re-open this case to consider additional evidence. Motion carried by majority.

M/S (CH/RL): In case number 22300, I move that the Executive Committee not find probable cause. Motion carried by majority.

M/S (CH/LH): In case number 22301, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend permanent revocation. Motion carried by majority.

M/S (CH/MR): In case number 22302, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend indefinite suspension with conditions. Motion carried by majority.

M/S (CH/KH): In case number 22303, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend permanent revocation. Motion carried by majority.

M/S (CH/JN): In case number 22304, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend a letter of reprimand. Motion carried by majority.

M/S (CH/RL) Application Consideration: I move that the Executive Committee recommend to the Chief Certification Officer that she issue an interim certificate and follow up with

him when he applies for a clear 5-year certificate.



APPENDIX D

Joint Committee Meeting

Standards and Recruitment, Retention and Authorizations Committees

700 W State Street, Boise; JRW West Conference Room

April 13, 2023

Members present: Stephanie Brodwater, Tate Castleton, Kristi Enger, Angela Gillman, Amy McBride, Karen Pyron, Lori Sanchez, Marianne Sletteland, Emma Wood

Members absent: Vanessa Anthony Stevens, Stacey Jensen

Committee called to order at 10:52 a.m.

1. PSC Staff Issuance Report – Information Item

- PSC Staff submitted thirty-one (31) Emergency Provisional Applications to be reviewed February 15, 2023 at the meeting of the State Board of Education. Thirty-one (31) were approved.
- PSC Staff submitted fourteen (14) Emergency Provisional Applications to be reviewed April 25, 2023 at the meeting of the State Board of Education.
- PSC Staff approved 45 completed Alternative Authorizations.

Alternative Authorization Type	Applications Approved
Content Specialist	24
Teacher to New Certificate	1
Teacher to New Endorsement	15
Pupil Service Staff	2
CTE-Content Specialist	3
CTE – Teacher to New Certificate	0
CTE – Teacher to New Endorsement	0
Totals	45

2. Draft Educator Preparation Provider Review Standards – Information Item

Katie Shoup, Educator Effectiveness Coordinator from the Office of the State Board, provided draft Educator Preparation Provider Review Standards for the joint committee’s review and feedback. These standards will help guide the creation of rubrics against which educator preparation providers will be reviewed. These standards will also help inform future processes for approval of new educator preparation providers in Idaho and approval of new programs from already- approved educator preparation providers.

Shoup handed out copies of the draft Educator Preparation Provider Review Standards and asked that attendees break into two groups to discuss the standards language and to document any feedback about the standards language. Upon the conclusion of group discussion, Shoup gathered the feedback in consideration of future edits to the draft Educator Preparation Provider Review Standards.

A question was asked about how districts or charters are held accountable to mentor program standards for their nontraditionally prepared candidates. While this concern is related to Educator Preparation Provider Review Standards, district/charter accountability is not included in this specific process.

3. Joint Committee Projects – Discussion

Cina Lackey, PSC Administrator, facilitated a discussion about how to continuously incorporate the Code of Ethics in school districts and charters for non-traditional candidates, current certified staff and classified staff, coaches, paraprofessionals, substitutes, and volunteers. The group discussion centered around creating free tool kits to provide to schools, to enhance their training and understanding of the Code of Ethics. Ideas included:

- Flash cards for staff discussion, possibly facilitated by experts
 - Possible scripts with scenarios
- Modules
 - Interactive situations
- Onboarding process
- ISBA model polices

Tool Box Ideas for Districts/Charters

Code of Ethics for classified and certified staff

- Flash Cards for staff discussion
 - Possibly facilitated by experts, e.g. attorney
 - Used for 10-minute discussions with staff
 - Possible Scripts
 - Specific Scenarios ~ case studies
- Modules
 - Choosing your own adventure
 - Interactive
 - Standardized
 - PowerPoint with quiz
- Trained professional to present PD to schools
- Yearly checklist
- Multiple trainings throughout tenure
- Onboarding process
- Specified training for certified versus classified
 - Coaches
 - Volunteers
 - Substitutes
- How to incorporate with ongoing PD and not an extra burden for schools?
- ISBA model policies
- Holvinka model policies
- Compare Pennsylvania, Kansas and Georgia's Professional Standards Commission training for Code of Ethics
- How to make free for schools