



APPROVED MINUTES OF THE IDAHO PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS COMMISSION (PSC)

Phone: 1 (253) 215-8782, Meeting ID 208 332 6879, Meeting Passcode 6879

Lewis & Clark Conference Room, 650 W State Street, Second Floor

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 7, 2023

1. Welcome and Announcements

Commission Chair Angela Gillman called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

Gillman introduced the Commission's new Deputy Attorney General, Kyle Grigsby. Grigsby replaces Jim Rice.

Commission Members Present: Stephanie Brodwater, Ryan Cantrell, Tate Castleton, Kristi Enger, Angela Gillman, Lance Harrison, Katie Horner, Stacey Jensen, Ramona Lee, Katie Mathias, Amy McBride, Jamee Nixon, Marci Nuxoll, Karen Pyron, MeLissa Rose, Lori Sanchez, Jonelle Warnock

Commission Members Absent: Vanessa Anthony-Stevens

2. Agenda Review/Approval

M/S (Lee/Enger)

I move to approve the December 7-8, 2023, agenda as written.

Roll Call Vote. **Motion carried.**

3. September 21-22, 2023, Minutes Review/Revision/Approval

M/S (Harrison/Nuxoll)

I move to approve the minutes from the September 21-22, 2023, meeting of the Professional Standards Commission as written.

Roll Call Vote. **Motion carried.**

4. Idahoans for Openness in Government (IDOG) Open Meeting Law Presentation

Idaho Department of Education Communications Director Scott Graf introduced the October 25, 2023, open meeting law video presentation by IDOG. Upon conclusion of the video presentation, Graf reiterated the "Reply All" via email is something to be careful about.

5. Committee Work

Commission Chair Angela Gillman resolved the full Commission into committee work at 10:49 a.m. The Recommendations Committee convenes at 12 noon, and the Executive Committee convenes at 2:00 p.m.

FRIDAY, DECEMBER 8, 2023

Full Commission, 9:00 am – 12:00 pm, or upon conclusion of business

Phone: 1 (253) 215-8782, Meeting ID 208 332 6879, Meeting Passcode 6879

Executive Conference Room, 650 W State Street, Second Floor

PSC Chair Angela Gillman called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

Commission Members Present: Stephanie Brodwater, Ryan Cantrell, Tate Castleton, Kristi Enger, Angela Gillman, Lance Harrison, Katie Horner, Stacey Jensen, Ramona Lee, Katie Mathias, Amy McBride, Jamee Nixon, Marci Nuxoll, Karen Pyron, MeLissa Rose, Jonelle Warnock

Commission Members Absent: Vanessa Anthony-Stevens, Lori Sanchez

1. Consideration of Ethics Investigation Final Orders/Stipulation Adoptions

Deputy Attorney General Kyle Grigsby presented the following cases to the Commission for consideration:

Case # 22311 M/S (Enger/Nuxoll)

In case number 22311, concerning the certificate of Christopher Perrigot, I move that the Professional Standards Commission accept the proposed stipulation as written and enter the accompanying consent order, which will be effective once signed.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - yes, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harrison - yes, Horner - recuse, Jensen - yes, Lee - recuse, Mathias - yes, McBride - recuse, Nixon - recuse, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carried.**

Case # 22313 M/S (Enger/Warnock)

In case number 22313, concerning the certificate of Mark Baer, I move that the Professional Standards Commission enter a final order that is effective when signed, incorporating as findings of fact the allegations in the administrative complaint, adopting any counts alleged by the Chief Certification Officer as conclusions of law, and imposing the discipline requested by the Chief Certification Officer in the Request for Relief in the Administrative Complaint, which is suspension for a period of two years, with the conditions that Mr. Baer complete an approved ethics course and that a licensed counselor provide a letter that demonstrates that he is fit to be in the classroom.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - recuse, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - recuse, Harrison - yes, Horner - recuse, Jensen - yes, Lee - recuse, Mathias - yes, McBride - recuse, Nixon - recuse, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carried.**

Case # 22238 M/S (Jensen/Pyron)

In case number 22238, concerning the certificate of Nancy Lucio, I move that the Professional Standards Commission enter a final order that is effective when signed, incorporating as findings of fact the allegations in the administrative complaint, adopting any counts alleged by the Chief Certification Officer as conclusions of law, and imposing the discipline requested by the Chief Certification Officer in the Request for Relief in the Administrative Complaint, which is a letter of reprimand and completion of an approved ethics course.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - recuse, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - recuse, Harrison - yes, Horner - recuse, Jensen - yes, Lee - recuse, Mathias - yes, McBride - recuse, Nixon - recuse, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carried.**

Case # 22315 M/S (Nuxoll/Brodwater)

In case number 22315, concerning the certificate of Wade Schvaneveldt, I move that the Professional Standards Commission enter a final order that is effective when signed, incorporating as findings of fact the allegations in the administrative complaint, adopting any counts alleged by the Chief Certification Officer as conclusions of law, and imposing the discipline requested by the Chief Certification Officer in the Request for Relief in the Administrative Complaint, which is permanent revocation.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - recuse, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - recuse, Harrison - yes, Horner - recuse, Jensen - yes, Lee - recuse, Mathias - yes, McBride - recuse, Nixon - recuse, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carried.**

Case # 22317 was not brought to the full Commission for consideration.

2. Board-Approved Updates to Emergency Provisional Process

Certification Coordinator Mandy Fulbright provided an overview of updates to the emergency provisional process approved by the Idaho State Board of Education effective October 18, 2023. Emergency provisional certificates cannot be used for either pupil service staff or administrator certificates. Also, the emergency provisional certificate cannot be issued for a special education endorsement. The emergency date and the hired educator's name must be declared in the hiring education agency's Board minutes.

3. Administrative Report – APPENDIX A

PSC Administrator Cina Lackey provided the Administrative Report. Lackey, PSC staff Annette Schwab, and Commission Chair Angela Gillman attended the Professional Practices Institute in Rhode Island in October. Lackey, Schwab, and Gillman shared their experience.

4. Office of the State Board Report – APPENDIX B

Educator Effectiveness Program Manager Katie Shoup provided a report from the Office of the State Board of Education (OSBE).

Educator preparation program process update: Standards for educator preparation providers were approved by the Idaho State Board of Education (Board) on August 23, 2023, and can be viewed on the OSBE site. The new program approval process and form were approved by the Board on October 28, 2023, and are also located on the OSBE site. Workgroups are continuing to develop a state review process, and will also work on a process for the approval of new providers. When the work is completed, these process documents will be presented to the PSC for input.

Mentoring and professional development platform: The request for a proposal for the development of this platform is completed, and the selected vendor is the Trinity Education group. The platform will connect educators with mentors from across the state and provide professional development and access to resources. Educators can complete courses, receive one-on-one or group mentoring, or participate in professional learning communities. Karen Pyron asked for the estimated launch date. Shoup responded that the launch date is still to be determined. Pyron asked if the professional development resources would incorporate the Board's mentoring standards. Shoup replied that the Board's mentoring standards will be incorporated. Lance Harrison mentioned that Preston School District would be happy to help pilot the platform.

Registered teacher apprenticeship program: The Board will review and vote on the proposed registered teacher apprenticeship program standards at their meeting scheduled for December 13, 2023. After the Board's decision, Shoup can provide more details about the program.

Rural and Underserved Educator Incentive Program: Selected awardees for the second cohort of rural and underserved educator incentive program will be notified this month. The application window for the third cohort will occur next spring through next fall. The second and third cohort of awardees will each number about 250 awardees.

5. Committee Reports

a. Operations Committee Report – APPENDIX C

Commission Vice Chair Remona Lee provided the Operations Committee Report.

b. Executive Committee Report – APPENDIX D

Commission Chair Angela Gillman and PSC staff member Annette Schwab provided the Executive Committee Report.

c. Recommendations Committee Report – APPENDIX E

Committee Chair Karen Pyron provided the Recommendations Committee Report.

M/S (Pyron/Lee)

I move to recommend the paraprofessional alternative assessment presented by the Boise School District to the State Board of Education for approval.

The Committee members discussed their takeaways from the presentation provided by Boise School District. Lance Harrison asked who would have oversight of the assessment and make future score adjustments, should future adjustments be warranted. Cina Lackey responded that this is new territory, and these logistical concerns should be addressed if the alternate assessment is approved by the State Board of Education. Ryan Cantrell commented on the importance of professional development for paraprofessionals.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - yes, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harrison - yes, Horner - yes, Jensen - yes, Lee - yes, Mathias - yes, McBride - yes, Nixon - yes, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - yes, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carried.**

M/S (Pyron/Jensen)

I move to recommend an amended qualifying score of 457 on the Educational Testing Service Paraprofessional Exam to the State Board of Education for approval.

Lance Harrison mentioned that he had followed up with Lisa Colón Durham at Educational Testing Service for more information about the paraprofessional assessment data, and he thinks an amended 457 qualifying score is reasonable and provides room for additional amendment.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - absent, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - yes, Castleton - yes, Enger - yes, Gillman - yes, Harrison - yes, Horner - yes, Jensen - yes, Lee - yes, Mathias - yes, McBride - yes, Nixon - yes, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - yes, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carried.**

6. Member Reports – Information Item

Karen Pyron provided a report from the Idaho School Boards Association (ISBA). The ISBA Annual Convention occurred a couple of weeks ago, and the ISBA membership had voted unanimously in favor of a resolution for an alternate paraprofessional assessment. The most recent ISBA policy updates include a policy that classified personnel are held accountable to the Idaho Code of Ethics for Professional Educators. Cina Lackey clarified that the accountability is at the district level only. The PSC has no authority over noncertificated classified staff.

Ramona Lee provided a report from the Idaho Association of Special Education Administrators (IASEA). The IASEA will be delighted to learn about the PSC recommendations to the Board of Education regarding the paraprofessional alternate assessment and a qualifying score reduction for the Educational Testing Service Paraprofessional Assessment. The IASEA appreciates the Idaho Department of Education's certification team and PSC staff for all their help with alternative authorizations. Behavior challenges are greater than ever before, and special education does not have the capacity to address all behavioral challenges.

Katie Mathias provided a report from the Idaho Association of Colleges of Teacher Education (IACTE). An employer satisfaction survey was sent out yesterday from Mathias on behalf of all of Idaho's colleges of teacher education. The data received in these surveys will be analyzed to improve the quality of educator preparation programs in Idaho. If you receive a survey for someone who is not at your location, please reply to Mathias.

Angela Gillman provided an update from the Idaho Education Association (IEA). The IEA's Center for Teaching and Learning (CTL) is offering professional development courses through Idaho State University, and all classes for IEA members are free. This is a tremendous opportunity, and an in-person dyslexia course is one of the offerings. Praxis preparation classes are also offered. Gillman will share the Commission's interest in professional development for paraprofessionals with CTL staff. The IEA's Lobby Day is occurring on January 15, 2024. Members from across the state will come to the capitol and speak with their legislators; about 200 IEA members plan to attend.

7. Adjourn

Meeting adjourned at 10:52 a.m.



APPENDIX A

Administrative Report

Friday, December 8, 2023

1. Income and Expenditures Report

- No budget information will be available until Luma reporting system is available

2. 2023-2024 SY – 641 Total Alternative Authorizations approved to date. 16 Emergency Provisional Certificates were approved at the SBOE October 18, 2023 meeting. 117 Provisional Certificate Applications submitted for SBOE review at the December 13, 2023 meeting.

- 171 Alternative Authorization – Content Specialist
- 18 Alternative Authorization – Teacher to New Certificate
- 120 Alternative Authorization – Teacher to New Endorsement
- 11 CTE Alternative Authorization – Content Specialist
- 15 CTE Alternative Authorization – Teacher to New Endorsements
- 2 CTE Alternative Authorization – Teacher to New Certificates
- 24 Alternative Authorization – Pupil Service Staff

3. Department Updates

- Rebranding
 - New Logo
 - Now Idaho Department of Education (IDE)
 - Department website redesign (coming soon)
- “Super in 10”
 - Superintendent of Public Instruction Debbie Critchfield will explore various topics related to K-12 public education in Idaho <https://www.sde.idaho.gov/communications/podcast.html>

4. PSC Website Redesign

- Educator Preparation Program information will now be on the State Board of Education website. <https://boardofed.idaho.gov/k-12-education/educator-effectiveness/educator-preparation-programs/>
- Alternative Authorization and Provisional counts are now on the Alternative Authorization webpage: <https://www.sde.idaho.gov/cert-psc/cert/apply/issued.html>
- Ethics and Recommendations Committee information will be on the PSC website: <https://www.sde.idaho.gov/cert-psc/psc/>

5. National Association of State Directors of Teacher Education and Certification (NASDTEC) Professional Practices Institute (PPI) Conference

- The PPI is a specialized program, addressing issues of educator misconduct, screening and background checks, and related topics.
- Angela Gillman, Annette Schwab, and Cina Lackey attended the conference in Providence, Rhode Island in October.



APPENDIX B

Professional Standards Commission Office of the State Board of Education Report December 7-8, 2023

- ❖ Educator Preparation Program Process Update
 - Idaho Standards for Educator Preparation Providers
 - (Approved August 23, 2023, State Board Meeting)
 - New Program Approval Guide
 - (Approved October 18, 2023, State Board Meeting)
 - Educator Preparation Provider Review Process Guide, Rubrics, and Self Study
 - New Provider Process
- ❖ Mentoring and Professional Development Software Platform Update
- ❖ Registered Teacher Apprenticeship Program Update
- ❖ Rural and Underserved Educator Incentive Program Update



APPENDIX C

Operations Committee Meeting

Phone: 1 (253) 215-8782, Meeting ID 208 332 6879, Meeting Passcode 6879

650 W State Street, Boise; Lewis & Clark Conference Room, Second Floor

Thursday, December 7, 2023

Members present: Kristi Enger, Angela Gillman, Ramona Lee, Amy McBride, Karen Pyron

Members absent: none

The committee was brought to order at 8:00 a.m. by Angela Gillman.

1. Agenda and Minutes Review/Discussion – Information Item

Announcements for the Commission:

- The Recommendations Committee Meeting will start at noon.
- The Executive Committee meeting will start at 2 pm.
- Final Orders and Stipulation Adoptions will be considered on Friday morning, instead of Thursday.
- The PSC's new Deputy Attorney General, Kyle Grigsby, will attend the meeting.

Agenda Discussion:

- The open meeting law presentation is a video presentation. The Department's Communications Director, Scott Graf, will introduce, and Cina will facilitate a discussion afterward.
- A Recommendation Proposal form is being piloted by year-end. The form will be housed on the PSC web page. The Recommendations Committee will report on this.

Agenda motion: I move to approve the December 7-8, 2023, agenda as written.

Minutes motion: I move to approve the minutes from the September 21-22, 2023, meeting of the Professional Standards Commission as written.

OR

I move to approve the minutes from the September 21-22, 2023, meeting of the Professional Standards Commission with the following amendment(s):

2. PSC Logistics and Future Meeting Discussion – Work Session

The following protocols are in place for the virtual meeting:

- Join the meeting with your video on.
- Mute yourself when you're not speaking.
- Raise your hand to speak. The virtual hand raised through the "reactions" feature will be easiest to notice, but the chair and vice chair will also watch for hands raised i
- Roll call is taken for every vote.
- Use the chat only to communicate technical issues.

Operations Committee Meeting adjourned at 8:11 a.m.



APPENDIX D

Executive Committee Meeting

Phone: 1 (253) 215-8782, Meeting ID 208 332 6864, Meeting Passcode 6864
650 W State Street, Boise; Lewis & Clark Conference Room, Second Floor

Thursday, December 7, 2023

Members present: Angela Gillman, Ryan Cantrell, Katie Horner, Ramona Lee, Amy McBride, Jamee Nixon, MeLissa Rose

Members absent: none

Staff present: Annette Schwab, Kyle Grigsby, Brian Church

M/S (AG/RL): Under Idaho Code 74-206 (1)(d), to move the Executive Committee into Executive Session to consider investigatory records exempt from disclosure under Chapter 1 of Title 74, Idaho Code. (02:01 PM) Gillman – Yes, Cantrell – Yes, Horner – Yes, Lee – Yes, McBride – Yes, Nixon – Yes, Rose – Yes. **Motion Carried.**

M/S (AG/JN): The Executive Committee of the Professional Standards Commission was called into Open Session, after entering Executive Session to consider investigatory records exempt from disclosure under Chapter 1 of Title 74 Idaho Code. (2:40 PM) Gillman – Yes, Cantrell – Yes, Horner – Yes, Lee – Yes, McBride – Yes, Nixon – Yes, Rose – Yes. **Motion Carried.**

M/S (RL/MR): In case number 22317, I move that the Executive Committee deny the stipulation counteroffer and hold to the previous stipulation. **Motion carried by majority.**

M/S (RL/MR): In case number 22327, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend permanent revocation. **Motion carried by majority.**

M/S (RL/JN): In case number 22314, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend revocation. **Motion carried by majority.**



APPENDIX E

Recommendations Committee Meeting

Phone: 1 (253) 215-8782, Meeting ID 208 332 6864, Meeting Passcode 6864

650 W State Street, Boise; Lewis & Clark Conference Room, Second Floor

Thursday, December 7, 2023

Members present: Stephanie Brodwater, Tate Castleton, Kristi Enger, Lance Harrison, Stacey Jensen, Katie Mathias, Amy McBride, Marci Nuxoll, Karen Pyron, Lori Sanchez, Jonelle Warnock

Members absent: Vanessa Anthony Stevens

The committee was called to order at 12:00 p.m.

1. Paraprofessional Requirements and Standards – Information Item
Stacie Rekow, Idaho Department of Education Federal Programs Coordinator, provided an overview of paraprofessional requirements and standards.
2. Paraprofessional Alternate Assessment Proposal – Action Item
Boise School District Staff: Jason Hutchison, Stacey Day, Laurel Johnston, Lizzie Blackwell, and Tony Day presented a proposal for a paraprofessional alternate assessment.
 - Commissioners acknowledged the need for another option to assess the knowledge of paraprofessionals. Discussion points included security measures, question banks for retakes, timeframe between retakes and options for specialized testing.

Motion for full PSC: I move to recommend the paraprofessional alternative assessment presented by the Boise School District to the State Board of Education for approval.

3. Paraprofessional Exam Qualifying Score Amendment – Action Item
Lisa Colón Durham, Educational Testing Service (ETS), provided a presentation on the ETS Paraprofessional Exam.
 - Commissioners reviewed Idaho's qualifying score of the paraprofessional assessment. Based on feedback from the field, the current score of 460 is often a barrier to paraprofessionals entering the classroom. Data provided in the presentation indicated the qualifying score was lower in some of the surrounding states. A lower score of 457 resulted in roughly a five percent increase in pass rates amongst test takers.

Motion for full PSC: I move to recommend an amended qualifying score of **457** on the Educational Testing Service Paraprofessional Exam to the State Board of Education for approval.

4. Recommendation Proposal Form – Work Session Cina Lackey provided an overview of the recommendation proposal form that will be piloted at year end. The form will be placed on the PSC webpage, and individuals, LEAs, and stakeholder groups can use the form to propose recommendations through the Recommendations Committee for PSC Consideration.

The Committee adjourned at 3:30 p.m.