



**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE IDAHO PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS COMMISSION (PSC)**

700 W State Street, Boise; JRW West Conference Room

**THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 21, 2023**

**Commission Chair Angela Gillman called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.**

Commission Members Present: Vanessa Anthony-Stevens, Stephanie Brodwater, Angela Gillman, Lance Harrison, Katie Horner, Stacey Jensen, Ramona Lee, Katie Mathias, Amy McBride, Jamee Nixon, Marci Nuxoll, Karen Pyron, MeLissa Rose, Jonelle Warnock

Commission Members Absent: Ryan Cantrell, Tate Castleton, Kristi Enger, Lori Sanchez

1. Agenda Review/Approval

**M/S (Mathias/Pyron)**

I move to approve the September 21-22, 2023, agenda as written.

Voice Vote. **Motion Carries**

2. June 15-16, 2023, Minutes Review/Revision/Approval

**M/S (Jensen/Horner)**

I move to approve the minutes from the June 15-16, 2023, meeting of the Professional Standards Commission as written.

Voice Vote. **Motion Carries**

3. Commissioner Training

PSC staff members Helen Henderson and Annette Schwab provided an overview of Commission work and the ethics complaint process.

4. Consideration of Final Orders/Stipulation Adoptions

Deputy Attorney General Jim Rice presented the following cases to the Commission for consideration:

**Case # 22307 M/S (Jensen/Nuxoll)**

In case number 22307, concerning the certificate of James Maloney, I move that the Professional Standards Commission accept the proposed stipulation as written and enter the accompanying consent order, which will be effective once signed.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - yes, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - absent, Castleton - absent, Enger - absent, Gillman - yes, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - yes, Lee - recuse, Mathias - yes, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carries.**

**Case # 22302 M/S (Pyron/Brodwater)**

In case number 22302, concerning the certificate of Brent Schindler, I move that the Professional Standards Commission accept the proposed stipulation as written and enter the accompanying consent order, which will be effective once signed.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - yes, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - absent, Castleton - absent, Enger - absent, Gillman - yes, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - yes, Lee - recuse, Mathias - yes, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carries.**

**Case # 22237 M/S (Brodwater/Warnock)**

In case number 22237, concerning the certificate of Gwendalyn Buthman, I move that the Professional Standards Commission enter a final order that is effective when signed, incorporating as findings of fact the allegations in the administrative complaint, adopting any counts alleged by the Chief Certification Officer as conclusions of law, and imposing the discipline requested by the Chief Certification Officer in the Request for Relief in the Administrative Complaint, which is permanent revocation.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - yes, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - absent, Castleton - absent, Enger -absent, Gillman - yes, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - yes, Lee - recuse, Mathias - yes, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carries.**

**Case # 22301 M/S (Nuxoll/Mathias)**

In case number 22301, concerning the certificate of Daniel Durham, I move that the Professional Standards Commission enter a final order that is effective when signed, incorporating as findings of fact the allegations in the administrative complaint, adopting any counts alleged by the Chief Certification Officer as conclusions of law, and imposing the discipline requested by the Chief Certification Officer in the Request for Relief in the Administrative Complaint, which is permanent revocation.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - yes, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - absent, Castleton - absent, Enger -absent, Gillman - yes, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - yes, Lee - recuse, Mathias - yes, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carries.**

**Case # 22303 M/S (Mathias/Jensen)**

In case number 22303, concerning the certificate of Sarai McCormick, I move that the Professional Standards Commission enter a final order that is effective when signed, incorporating as findings of fact the allegations in the administrative complaint, adopting any counts alleged by the Chief Certification Officer as conclusions of law, and imposing the discipline requested by the Chief Certification Officer in the Request for Relief in the Administrative Complaint, which is permanent revocation.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - yes, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - absent, Castleton - absent, Enger -absent, Gillman - yes, Harrison - recuse, Horner - recuse, Jensen - yes, Lee - recuse, Mathias - yes, McBride - yes, Nixon - recuse, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - recuse, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - yes. **Motion Carries.**

5. PSC Annual Report – Information Item

Helen Henderson reviewed the 2022-2023 PSC Annual Report. The report will be submitted as an information item at the December 2023 meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education.

6. Committee Work

Commission Chair Angela Gillman resolved the full Commission into committee work at 11:50 a.m.

**FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 22, 2023**

**Commission Chair Angela Gillman called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m.**

Commission Members Present: Vanessa Anthony-Stevens, Stephanie Brodwater, Angela Gillman, Lance Harrison, Katie Horner, Stacey Jensen, Ramona Lee, Amy McBride, Jamee Nixon, Marci Nuxoll, Karen Pyron, MeLissa Rose

Commission Members Absent: Ryan Cantrell, Tate Castleton, Kristi Enger, Katie Mathias, Lori Sanchez, Jonelle Warnock

1. Consideration of Final Orders/Stipulation Adoptions, continued

**Case # 22240 M/S(Brodwater/Jensen)**

In case number 22304, concerning the certificate of Robert Kiser, I move that the Professional Standards Commission accept the proposed stipulation as written and enter the accompanying consent order, which will be effective once signed.

Roll call: Anthony-Stevens - yes, Brodwater - yes, Cantrell - absent, Castleton - yes, Enger -absent, Gillman - yes, Harrison - yes, Horner - yes, Jensen - yes, Lee - yes, Mathias - absent, McBride - yes, Nixon - yes, Nuxoll - yes, Pyron - yes, Rose - yes, Sanchez - absent, Warnock - absent. **Motion Carries.**

Discussion of case # 22311 is deferred to the December meeting of the PSC.

2. Administrative Report (APPENDIX A)

Cina Lackey, PSC Administrator, provided the Administrative Report.

Helen Henderson added that income and expenditure updates will be provided through this report as PSC staff become more acquainted with the new state-wide accounting system that was implemented July 1.

Lance Harrison asked about the requirements for an alternative authorization for a speech language pathologist (SLP). PSC staff member Mandy Fulbright explained the requirements. Harrison added that there are not enough open positions in SLP programs for educators who want to be in the program.

Ramona Lee added that SLP is such a limited program that a person can wait for an extended period of time to even be accepted into a program.

3. Committee Reports

a. Operations Committee Report (APPENDIX B)

Ramona Lee provided the Operations Committee Report.

b. Executive Committee Report (APPENDIX C)

Angela Gillman provided the Executive Committee Report.

c. Joint Committee Report (APPENDIX D)

Karen Pyron provided the Joint Committee Report.

**M/S (Pyron/Horner)**

I move to approve the amendments to the PSC Manual as presented.

`Voice Vote. **Motion Carries**

4. Member Reports – Information Item

Vanessa Anthony Stevens provided a report from the Idaho Indian Education Committee (IIEC). The next Idaho Indian Education Summit is scheduled to occur August 1-2 2024, In Boise.

Volume II of the publication *United Voices*, an educational resource to enhance understanding of Idaho's five tribes, is coming out from the IIEC in late 2024-early 2025. Please contact Johanna Jones at the State Department of Education with any questions or requests for Volume I or II of *United Voices*.

Karen Pyron provided an update from the Idaho School Boards Association (ISBA). ISBA's annual convention is scheduled to occur in November. Resolutions approved by ISBA membership at the convention move forward for legislative work. A resolution is coming forward regarding the paraprofessional assessment, which should make it easier for local districts to administer the assessment. Pyron asked PSC Administrator Cina Lackey to provide some additional context.

Lackey added that there had been some concern that districts would not be able to administer the ETS paraprofessional assessment in their district, and as a result, Boise School District has developed draft competencies and an alternate assessment for paraprofessionals. Lackey has confirmed with ETS that districts are still going to be able to administer the paraprofessional assessment in their district. On a related note, many states have lowered the cut score for the ETS paraprofessional assessment. In December the joint committee will discuss the ETS paraprofessional assessment cut score, and they will also look at the competencies and alternate assessment drafted by Boise School District.

Pyron added that robust conversations about breach of contract are continuing at ISBA. It's a genuine concern for districts, especially those who are close to other state borders. Prior PSC conversations have been helpful for ISBA to communicate with its members how Board actions can affect a breach of contract complaint.

Ramona Lee provided a report from the Idaho Associations of Special Education Administrators (IASEA). The IASEA is following the ETS paraprofessional assessment conversation. The ETS assessment is a significant cost to districts. West Ada has been collaborating with Boise School District on the draft alternate assessment. There's a lot of interest in having another option for paraprofessional assessment, and the ETS assessment cut score discussion is necessary.

The breach of contract conversation continues at IASEA, as well, and it's important that district staff know how to properly address a breach of contract situation.

The IASEA is wondering whether there will be some path forward for special educators through the apprenticeship program that is currently in development, though it may not be an option to maintain compliance with IDEA.

There is concern that anyone pursuing a special education director endorsement must first complete a principal endorsement program. Special education candidates have been told by educator preparation providers that this is a state requirement. Can the PSC have a conversation about this?

5. Travel Reimbursement Training – Information Item

Helen Henderson provided information regarding the travel reimbursement form.

6. PSC Chair Angela Gillman adjourned the meeting upon completion of the last agenda item.

Meeting adjourned at 10:24 a.m.



## APPENDIX A

### Administrative Report

700 W State Street, Boise; JRW West Conference Room

Friday, September 22, 2023

#### 1) FY23 Final Income and Expenditures Report

- Revenue from certification fees: \$669,160
- Expenditures including salaries and benefits: \$574,597.56
- Transactions balanced; revenue exceeded expenditures by \$94,562.44

#### 2) 2023-2024 SY – 280 Total Alternative Authorizations Approved to Date, and 17 Provisional Certificate Applications for SBOE Review at their October 18, 2023 Meeting

- 138 Alternative Authorization – Content Specialist
- 10 Alternative Authorization – Teacher to New Certificate
- 104 Alternative Authorization – Teacher to New Endorsement
- 4 CTE Alternative Authorization – Content Specialist
- 6 CTE Alternative Authorization – Teacher to New Endorsements
- 18 Alternative Authorization – Pupil Service Staff

#### NOTE: State Board of Education Emergency Provisional Change in Process

33-1203. ACCREDITED TEACHER TRAINING REQUIREMENTS. Except in the limited fields of trades and industries and specialists certificates of school librarians and school nurses, the state board shall not authorize the issuance of any standard certificate premised upon less than four (4) years of accredited college training, including such professional training as the state board may require, or the successful completion of a state board of education-approved registered apprenticeship program for teachers; but in emergencies, which must be declared, the state board may authorize the issuance of provisional certificates based on not less than two (2) years of college training.

**Based on Deputy Attorney General determination, the provisional can only be used for teachers. Local Education Agencies can, however, use an Alternative Authorization Teacher to New Certificate for someone that already holds a certificate to allow them to be the administrator while working toward earning the administrator certificate. For Pupil Service Staff, the interpretation of the Alternative Authorization – Pupil Service Staff route was reviewed by the office of the State Board of Education; in addition to School Counselor and School Social Worker, the AA-PSS can now be used for School Psychologist and Speech Language Pathologist endorsement areas.**

- 3) **Praxis II Multistate Standard Setting Nomination Emails** – Opportunity for education professionals to participate in the review process of regenerated and new Praxis II assessments and score setting.
- 4) **Collaboration between State Board of Education and State Department on Mentoring**
- 5) **Upcoming Travel - NASDTEC Professional Practices Institute (PPI) October 18-20, 2023**
  - The PPI is a specialized program, addressing issues of educator misconduct, screening and background checks, and related topics. The Institute rotates among the NASDTEC four geographic regions. This year the conference is in Providence, RI.
  - Angela Gillman, Annette Schwab and Cina Lackey will be attending.



## APPENDIX B

### Operations Committee Meeting

650 W State Street, Boise; Lewis and Clark Conference Room, Second Floor

**Thursday, September 21, 2023**

Members present: Angela Gillman, Ramona Lee, Karen Pyron, Amy McBride

Members absent: Kristi Enger

Committee brought to order at 8:10 a.m. by Ramona Lee, then passed chair duties to Angela Gillman.

1. Agenda and Minutes Review/Discussion – Information Item

**Agenda motion:** I move to approve the September 21-22, 2023, agenda as written.

**Minutes motion:** I move to approve the minutes from the June 15-16, 2023, meeting of the Professional Standards Commission as written.

**OR**

I move to approve the minutes from the June 15-16, 2023, meeting of the Professional Standards Commission with the following amendment(s):

Commissioner Training (Thursday, Item 3) will include an opportunity for all members to introduce themselves. In addition to a general training on PSC work, PSC staff member Annette Schwab will provide a training on the ethics complaint process.

As discussed at the June Operations Committee meeting, the Income and Expenditures Report is now included in the Administrative Report given by the PSC Administrator. While the Administrative Report will include the final Income and Expenditures Report for FY23, which ended June 30, there is no information to share regarding year-to-date expenditures and income for FY24. A new-state-wide accounting system was rolled out in July, and that reporting is not yet available.

2. Future Speakers – Work Session. Operations Committee members are encouraged to suggest possible future speakers for the PSC.

3. PSC Discussion – Work Session

No discussion.

Meeting adjourned at 8:45 a.m.



## APPENDIX C

### Executive Committee Meeting

650 W State Street, Boise; Lewis & Clark Conference Room, Second Floor

**Thursday, September 21, 2023**

Members present: Angela Gillman, Katie Horner, Ramona Lee, Amy McBride, Jamee Nixon, MeLissa Rose  
Staff present: Annette Schwab and Jim Rice

**M/S (RL/MR): Under Idaho Code 74-206 (1)(d), to move the Executive Committee into Executive Session to consider investigatory records exempt from disclosure under Chapter 1 of Title 74, Idaho Code. (11:54 AM)** Gillman – Yes, Cantrell – Absent, Horner – Yes, Lee – Yes, McBride – Yes, Nixon – Yes, Rose – Yes

**M/S (RL/KH): The Executive Committee of the Professional Standards Commission was called into Open Session, after entering Executive Session to consider investigatory records exempt from the disclosure under Chapter 1 of Title 74 Idaho Code. (2:50 PM)** Gillman – Yes, Cantrell – Absent, Horner – Yes, Lee – Yes, McBride – Yes, Nixon – Yes, Rose – Yes

**M/S (KH/MR): In case number 22104, I move that the Executive Committee not find probable cause.** Motion carried by majority.

**M/S (KH/MR): In case number 22240, I move that the Executive Committee accept the stipulation counteroffer.** Motion carried by majority.

**M/S (MR/JN): In case number 22241, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend permanent revocation.** Motion carried by majority.

**M/S (RL/KH): In case number 22305, I move that the Executive Committee not find probable cause.** Motion carried by majority.

**M/S (JN/KH): In case number 22311, I move that the Executive Committee accept the stipulation counteroffer.** Motion carried by majority.

**M/S (RL/KH): In case number 22316, I move that the Executive Committee hold this case for additional investigation.** Motion carried by majority.

**M/S (MR/RL): In case number 22317, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend indefinite suspension.** Motion carried by majority.

**M/S (KH/AM): In case number 22318, I move that the Executive Committee not find probable cause.** Motion carried by majority.

**M/S (KH/AM): In case number 22319, I move that the Executive Committee not find probable cause.** Motion carried by majority.



**M/S (MR/JN): In case number 22320, I move that the Executive Committee not find probable cause. Motion carried by majority.**

**M/S (MR/JN): In case number 22321, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend indefinite suspension. Motion carried by majority.**

**M/S (MR/JN): In case number 22322, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend permanent revocation. Motion carried by majority.**

**M/S (KH/JN): In case number 22323, I move that the Executive Committee not find probable cause. Motion carried by majority.**

**M/S (AM/KH): In case number 22324, I move that the Executive Committee not find probable cause. Motion carried by majority.**

**M/S (MR/JN): In case number 22325, I move that the Executive Committee find probable cause and recommend permanent revocation. Motion carried by majority.**

Additionally, the Executive Committee recommended that the Chief Certification Officer not clear the background check for a student teacher.



## APPENDIX D

### Joint Committee Meeting

### Standards and Recruitment, Retention and Authorizations Committees

700 W State Street, Boise; JRW West Conference Room

**Thursday, September 21, 2023**

Members present: Vanessa Anthony Stevens, Stephanie Brodwater, Lance Harrison, Stacey Jensen, Katie Mathias, Amy McBride, Marci Nuxoll, Karen Pyron, Jonelle Warnock

Members absent: Kristi Enger, Lori Sanchez, Tate Castleton

Committee called to order at 12:00 p.m.

1. New Program Approval Documents for Educator Preparation Program Providers – Action Item

A draft New Program Approval Guide had been reviewed in June by the Joint Committee, and the Office of the State Board considered the committee's initial recommendations. A second review of the draft New Program Approval Guide was requested by the Office of the State Board, and the Joint Committee provided a second review.

No motion. Additional revision recommendations will be delivered to Katie Shoup at the Office of the State Board.

2. PSC Manual Amendments for Committee Reorganization

Helen Henderson provided an overview of the amendments recommended by PSC staff to the PSC Manual to accommodate the merger of the Standards and Recruitment, Retention, and Authorizations Committee into one Recommendations Committee. Minor grammar amendments were made, and the final, revised document was placed in the SFTP for full commission consideration on Friday.

Motion for Full PSC: I move to approve the amendments to the PSC Manual as presented.

Meeting Adjourned 3:12 pm.